



The Academic Senate

CITY COLLEGE OF SAN FRANCISCO

50 Frida Kahlo Way, Bungalow 604, San Francisco, CA 94112 (415) 239-3611 Fax (415) 452-5115
www.ccsf.edu/academic-senate email: asenate@ccsf.edu

CCSF Academic Senate Executive Council Final Minutes

Wednesday, October 9, 2024, 2:30-5:00 pm
MUB 140 or Via [Zoom](#)

[October 9 Meeting Materials](#) | [ASEC Zoom Meeting Pro Tips](#) | [Community Guidelines](#) | [Guide to CCSF Acronyms](#)

Councilmembers present: Monica Bosson, Jessica Buchsbaum, Katia Fuchs, Mike Greenberg, Thomas Kennedy, Fanny Law, Alex Leyton (remote voting), Alexis Litzky, Lillian Marrujo-Duck, Craig Persiko, Jonathan Potter, Pablo Rodriguez (remote non-voting), Lisa Romano, Chad Stephenson, Richard Taha, Fred Teti

Councilmembers absent: Miguel Galarza, Mitra Sapienza

Other Senators present: Nuala Sheetz, Landi Ehnle, Abigail Bornstein

Guests: Mallinalli Villalobos, Maureen Harrington

1. Call to Order 2:30

[CCSF Land Acknowledgement](#)

We acknowledge that we are on the unceded, ancestral homeland of the Ramaytush Ohlone who are the original inhabitants of the San Francisco Peninsula. As the indigenous stewards of this land and in accordance with their traditions, the Ramaytush Ohlone have never ceded, lost nor forgotten their responsibilities as the caretakers of this place, as well as for all peoples who reside in their traditional territory. As guests, we recognize that we benefit from living and working on their traditional homeland. We wish to pay our respects by acknowledging the ancestors, elders, and relatives of the Ramaytush Community and by affirming their sovereign rights as First Peoples.

President Litzky shared an historical photo from 1959 looking west over CCSF and the newly paved Balboa Reservoir.

2. Adoption of Agenda

The Agenda was adopted by a roll call vote with 14 voting members.

3. Public Comment

- A. Fred Teti: Ed Policies will meet and review Board Policies on auditing, field trips and excursions. Email Fred to attend.
- B. Fanny Law: Non-Credit Adult Education (NCAE) committee reflected on AEP allocation and will pay closer attention to the timeline and brevity of source requests. Plans to discuss further and make the allocations process

- part of the committee description. Registration for non credit students: programs are full and wait lists are happening.
- C. Jessica Buchsbaum: Program Review should look at requests for processes to complete the loop back to requestors. Building temperatures continued to be very severe during the heatwave. A policy is needed to indicate closures.
 - D. Tom Kennedy: Facilities' heating and cooling issues continue to be troubling. Last week's heat wave was challenging.
 - E. Monica Bosson: Student Health Center is giving free flu shots to students until supplies run out.

4. Reports

A. Officers Reports

1. [President's report](#) (see Appendix 1) - Faculty participation continues to be needed in several committees at the college. Program Mapper will be used by students to help build an educational plan. Several events from Flex Day were presented and attendance was encouraged.
2. 1st Vice-President Lillian Marrujo-Duck - Attending committee meetings including Planning Committee and Student Access and Matriculation Advisory Committee (SAMAC).
3. 2nd Vice-President Katia Fuchs - SAMAC is setting goals for the committee including recruitment of students and classified members to the committee and working with Office of Research and Planning (ORP) to discover impacts using qualitative data. Qualitative feedback included: experiences with faculty/staff, navigating programs, need for resources and physical spaces, and inequitable barriers. Faculty are encouraged to learn more about the Honors program with possible updates for the Senate. Strategic Enrollment Management Plan Completion work group is building out a spreadsheet with actions, timeline, and implementation. She will be attending the State Senate plenary on November 7-9, 2024.
4. Secretary Chad Stephenson - Senate meets quorum by voting members arriving on time. Senate resolutions continue to be assembled for online access. The Noncredit Adult Education Committee is continuing to thrive.

B. AFT2121 report - Robin Pugh reporting

1. General membership meeting Tuesday, Oct 22—all members encouraged to come.
2. Heat is a worksite issue; the grievance team has been alerted and has met with Facilities to express concerns and will expect a more proactive approach when weather conditions are expected to cause issues. SchoolDude is no longer being used by Facilities—a new system on the

Facilities website is used for submitting reports on facilities-related issues. Certain conditions apply when the workplace meets excessive heat based on CalOSHA standards.

C. Student Chancellor report – Malinali Villalobos

1. Facilities reports by instructors are helpful to students who cannot submit them
2. Mission campus has completed elections for Student Council with a very high turnout. No Associated Students meeting this week due to convention.
3. Next meeting, Friday, October 18, 2024 will feature Dr. Lillian Marrujo-Duck on student representation.
4. Special elections for Evans are being established. Reach out to studentchancellor@mail.ccsf.edu for information.

D. Committee on Committees report - 1st Vice-President Lillian Marrujo Duck

1. Two appointments being presented for today as part of the Consent Agenda

5. Consent Agenda

A. Approval of [Minutes from September 25, 2024](#)

2024.09.25.5.A. Approval of Minutes: Minutes from September 25, 2024

Resolved, the Executive Council approves the minutes for September 25, 2024.

Adopted by consent.

B. Approval of Committee Appointments

2024.09.25.5.B. Approval of Committee Appointments

Resolved, the Executive Council approves the following appointments:

DEA Subcommittee

Susan Schall, Noncredit ESL (new appointment)

Ed Policies

James Macale, Counseling (new appointment)

Adopted by consent.

6. Unfinished Business

A. Academic Senate meeting practices

1. Room design and accessibility – improvements are best when people speak more loudly, people speak one at a time; the room was not designed for this space and requires more intentionality from the speaker; video and audio recordings of meetings will be posted going forward; an additional microphone is possible; Brown Act can be in effect (“just cause”) that you are at work (e.g. at a work location); quorum is met to begin meeting and will be needed for all voting
2. Meeting attendance record-keeping - [AS & The Brown Act](#) (see Appendix 2 for AS & The Brown Act slide deck)
 - a) AB 2449 specifies “just cause” for attendance and voting
 - b) “Just Cause” and “Emergency Circumstances” were defined
 - c) Discussion was held on specific questions and concerns
 - d) Brown Act traditionally allows a local agency to use teleconferencing with conditions

B. Revisiting Academic Senate Constitution Review - President Litzky

1. President Litzky shared the [Jan 2024 ASEC Plenary Constitution and By-Laws slide deck](#)
 - a) President Litzky: Constitution review process began in 2020 with regular updates to Academic Senate
2. [Resolution 2024.04.24.6A Constitution and Bylaws Membership](#)
 - a) Senate discussed issues of encouragement toward greater membership and participation, changes to the Constitution, recruitment, changes in term limits, an effort to diversify representation, and workload challenges due to faculty cuts

C. [Enrollment Management Philosophy](#) - President Litzky (Think-Pair-Share activity)

1. President Litzky shared a set of questions on several topics about enrollment with small groups; each group discussed whether the question should be included in the enrollment management process. An “inclusion meter” would be used as a measurement guide to evaluate each question and the answers. Questions included:
 - a) What role should program revitalization or discontinuation play in scheduling or enrollment management decisions?
 - b) What role should completion and success rates play in scheduling or enrollment management decisions?
 - c) How might we define or measure the health and vitality of an existing program?

d) How might we infuse equity into enrollment management planning?

2. Discussion

a) If low course completion rates, this should not be prioritized but faculty should be encouraged to improve

b) Health and vitality: How we define health and vitality is key to enrollment management: if/how does the program get students “where they want to be”; “Health” and “vitality” have to be measured in a variety of ways; should we measure vitality? Students are enrolled and students complete the class, it is connected to post-program efficacy or purpose; taking into account “zero” completion and “low” completion

c) Philosophy vs. strategy: Other measures outside of completion are not always indicative of “success”; a need to connect to college philosophy—what is the plan and what is needed to revitalize (people, places)?; long range planning is needed

d) Focus on equity: there should be focus on equity population need; all student populations should be considered, not only transfer-students

e) Other: college budgeting may not include enrollment management; Enrollment Management needs to be student-focused and student-driven

7. The Senate took a five-minute break.

8. New Business

A. [BP 8.17 Grants](#) & [AP 8.17 Grants](#) - Maureen Harrington, Office of Research and Planning

1. BP 8.17 supports accreditation

2. AP 8.17 removes AVC of Institutional Development or Chancellor, Controller, VC of Finance and Administration or designee, and adds Chancellor’s Cabinet; ASEC will receive a biannual report on grant activity; Institutional Development will provide an annual written information report to the BoT regarding proposal in progress

3. [Lillian Marrujo-Duck](#) spoke against changes to AP 8.17 area C; this was captured in Area B; Maureen responded that grant application timelines have shortened and changes are needed to reflect an updated timeline

4. Robin Pugh asked about changes to section B and the addition of the Chancellor's Cabinet; this was meant to simplify and consolidate titles appointed by Chancellor into one group
5. Fred Teti asked about Part C; consider adding Senate President to Part B
6. Second reading will happen at a later date with updates

9. Adjournment 5:08pm – Moved by Monica Bosson, seconded by Katia Fuchs

Appendices

Appendix 1: President's Report



October 9, 2024

- a. [Calls for faculty participation](#)
- b. PGC Standing Committees – 3 appointments per group + alternates
- c. Pathways Program Mapper
- d. [Flex day events](#)
 - i. Morning – [CPL, Title IX training](#)
 - ii. Afternoon – [Program Review, Qualitative data](#)

Upcoming events

1. [Area B meeting](#). Virtual. Fri, October 18, 9am–3pm
2. [Credit for Prior learning \(CPL\) Summit](#). Virtual. Fri, November 1, 8:30am–12pm
3. [OERI Regionals](#). Chabot College. Fri, November 1, 8:30am–3:30pm.
4. [Curriculum Regionals](#). Merritt College. Sat, November 16, 9am–3pm.

Appendix 2: Academic Senate & The Brown Act slide deck



ACADEMIC SENATE & THE BROWN ACT

<https://bit.ly/ASBrownAct>



“The people, in delegating authority, do not give their public servants the right to decide what is good for the people to know and what is not good for them to know.” California Government Code §54950

WHY?



01

WHY?

AB 2449

Gov. Code § 54953(f)(1)

- All members are required to attend meetings in person.
- The exception would be the two (2) times allowed per calendar year to attend remotely due to “just cause” or emergency circumstance.
- With sufficient notice, a personal emergency allows for the council member to attend remotely, however their attendance does not count towards the necessary in-person quorum that must be established in order to conduct the business of the meeting.

01

ATTENDANCE CATEGORIES



Member attends meeting in person at designated location. Counted for quorum. Participates as a voting member.

PRESENT



Member attends meeting remotely using Brown Act teleconferencing guidelines. Counted for quorum. Participates as a voting member.

**PRESENT,
REMOTE VOTING**



Member attends meeting on Zoom without accommodation, just cause or extraordinary circumstances. Does not count for quorum. Does not vote.

**PRESENT,
REMOTE NON-VOTING**



Member does not attend the meeting or participate in any business.

ABSENT

02

ATTENDANCE CATEGORIES

	QUORUM	VOTING	RECORDED AS PRESENT
PRESENT	✓	✓	✓
PRESENT, REMOTE VOTING	✓	✓	✓
PRESENT, REMOTE NON-VOTING	✗	✗	✓
ABSENT	⊗	⊗	⊗

02

Brown Act Teleconferencing Rules

Gov. Code §54953(b)(1)

The Brown Act traditionally allows a local agency to use teleconferencing, subject to specific agenda posting, physical access and quorum requirements, including:

- Post agendas at each teleconference location;
- Identify each teleconference location in the notice and agenda of the meeting or proceeding;
- Make each teleconference location accessible to the public;

continued on next slide

03

Brown Act Teleconferencing Rules

- continued -

- All votes must be done through roll call;
- Have at least a quorum of the members of the legislative body participate from locations within the boundaries of the applicable local agency's territory; and
- Provide means for the public to address the legislative body at each teleconference location.

03

Just Cause or Emergency Circumstances Defined

Just Cause defined as:

- Childcare or caregiving need of a child, parent, grandparent, grandchild, sibling, spouse, or domestic partner;
- A contagious illness that prevents the member from attending in person;
- A need related to physical or mental disability; OR
- Travel while on official business...

Emergency Circumstances defined as:

- A physical or family medical emergency that prevents a member from attending in person.

03

“Just Cause” or “Emergency Circumstances”

Requires that a majority (quorum) of the members (9) of the legislative body participate:

- (1) In person;
- (2) From a singular, physical location clearly identified on the agenda;
- (3) That is open to the public; and
- (4) Situated within the boundaries of the territory over which the local agency exercises jurisdiction.

If YES to all 4 points, then a minority of members may attend remotely under the certain conditions.

03

WHAT SHOULD I DO?

Just cause

For “Just Cause,” the member provides notice to the chair as soon as possible as to the reasons for the remote appearance

All remote members

- The member attending remotely must identify anyone 18 years of age or older who is present in the room and state the general nature of the relationship
- A member participating remotely must participate through both audio and visual technology.

Emergency Circumstances

For “Emergency Circumstances,” the member must request approval as soon as possible; and the legislative body must take action to approve the request



04