Certification of Continued Institutional Compliance with Commission Policies

During the self-evaluation process, the College reviewed its compliance with Commission Policies. As directed in the *Manual for Institutional Self Evaluation* (October 2015), the section below covers the nine policies that the Eligibility Requirements and Standards do not directly address. The Institutional Analysis addresses the remainder of the Commission Policies within the appropriate "Evidence of Meeting the Standards" sections.

Commission Policy on Rights and Responsibilities of the Commission and Member Institutions

The Commission is committed to partnering with a member institution in a voluntary nongovernmental accreditation process that results in a mutual commitment to self-regulation, quality assurance to the public, and continuous institutional improvement. The Commission and its member institutions share rights and responsibilities to develop and promulgate Accreditation Standards and an agreed-upon accrediting process for comprehensive review. The institutional Chief Executive Officer is the chief representative of the institution to the Commission. The Commission communicates to the institution primarily through the Chief Executive Officer.

Evidence that CCSF Complies with the Policy on Rights and Responsibilities of the Commission and Member Institutions

City College of San Francisco is committed to self regulation, quality assurance to the public, and continual institutional improvement as demonstrated by this Institutional Self Evaluation. Board Policy 1.33 (Accreditation Eligibility Requirement) provides assurance that CCSF, as represented by the Board of Trustees and the Chancellor (Chief Executive Officer), adheres to the Commission's Eligibility Requirements, Accreditation Standards, and policies.[1]

In its 2006 Self Evaluation, 2012 Self Evaluation, and in all subsequent follow-up reports, the College has met Standard IV.A.4. (pre-2014 Standards) and Eligibility Requirement 21.[2] The College has dedicated an exceptional amount of time and effort in the past few years in particular toward meeting all ACCJC requirements and has completed a series of rigorous reports in the process, in addition to regular Annual and Fiscal Reports.[3][4][5][6][7][8][9]

---

[1] Board Policy 1.33 - Accreditation Eligibility Requirement 21
[2] 2006 Accreditation Visiting Team Report; 2012 Accreditation Visiting Team Report
[3] Other Reports Archive
[4] Self Study 2012
[5] Special Report, October 2012
[6] Show Cause Report, March 2013
[7] Eligibility Report, July 2014
[8] Substantive Change Report - Change in Location, February 2014
[9] Institutional Self Evaluation Report in Application for Restoration Status, October 2014

The Chancellor is the chief representative of the institution to the Commission and is the primary recipient of Commission communications. She responds as appropriate and directs staff to take action as needed.

Analysis and Evaluation of the College's Compliance with the Policy on Rights and Responsibilities of the Commission and Member Institutions

As demonstrated through this Institutional Self Evaluation and a number of additional recent reports and documents prepared for the Commission, the College complies with this policy.

Commission Policy on Institutional Degrees and Credits

An accredited institution conforms to a commonly accepted minimum program length of 60 semester credit hours or 90 quarter credit hours awarded for achievement of student learning for an associate degree and 120 semester credit hours or 180 quarter credit hours for a bachelor's degree. Any exception to this minimum must be explained and justified.

An accredited institution must have in place written policies and procedures for determining a credit hour that generally meet commonly accepted academic expectations and it must apply the policies and procedures consistently to its courses and programs.

Evidence that CCSF Complies with the Commission Policy on Institutional Degrees and Credits

CCSF conforms to a commonly accepted minimum program length of 60 semester credit hours awarded for achievement of student learning for an associate degree as shown in both the "Associate Degree Graduation Requirements" and "Programs and Courses" sections of the College Catalog.[10] [11] CCSF's Curriculum Handbook includes the written policies and procedures for determining credit hours that meet commonly accepted academic expectations, and the College applies the policies and procedures consistently to its courses and programs by having all courses and programs receive approval through the Curriculum Committee when newly created and later when modified.[12] [13]

The Catalog, under "Credits and Grades" states that "one unit of credit requires a minimum of *48* hours of lecture, study, or laboratory work."[14] In Spring 2015 and the first part of Fall 2015, the College's Curriculum Committee clarified the way that course hours should be specified, and how these course hours should translate to units. The Curriculum Committee has settled on using a standard of **52.5** hours of lecture, study, or laboratory work per unit of credit, as documented in CCSF's Curriculum Handbook.[15] This is in keeping with both the federal requirement and the

---

[10] CCSF 2016-2017 Catalog ,p. 47, AA/AS Degree Graduation Requirements
[11] CCSF 2016-2017 Catalog, p. 68, Programs & Courses
[12] CCSF Curriculum Handbook Course Specific: Units/Hours
[13] CCSF Curriculum Handbook Curriculum Approval Process
[14] CCSF 2016-2017 Catalog, p. 446, Academic Policies and Procedures
[15] CCSF Curriculum Handbook Course Specific: Units/Hours

Title 5 requirement, and is in keeping with the State Chancellor's Office Program and Course Approval Handbook. The 2016-17 Catalog contains this new information. To ensure consistent use in the 2016-17 academic year and Catalog, the College reviewed all courses and made adjustments to course hours and/or course units where these were inconsistent with the standard established by the Curriculum Committee.

The calendar of instruction establishes 35 total weeks of instruction, where a week is defined as having at least three continuous days of instruction Monday to Friday.[16] This exceeds the Federal Academic Year standard of 30 weeks of instruction per academic year.

The 12 unit per semester standard for full-time students is aligned with the federal requirement of 24 semester units per academic year.[17]

"Direct Assessment Programs" allows for class credits to be awarded based on student competency, without the student having to take the class, as long as the institution meets federal requirements in so doing. 34 CFR 668.10 is the Federal Regulations regarding Direct Assessment Programs, and starts with this:

> A direct assessment program is an instructional program that, in lieu of credit hours or clock hours as a measure of student learning, utilizes direct assessment of student learning, or recognizes the direct assessment of student learning by others. The assessment must be consistent with the accreditation of the institution or program utilizing the results of the assessment.

The "Credit by Examination" section of the Catalog begins: "According to Section 55050 of Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations, community college governing boards are authorized to grant credit by examination ..." and continues on for two pages with instructions for procedures and methods.[18] The College's Credit by Exam policy awards students credit hours (units).

The Curriculum Committee website contains a list of all resolutions and policies.[19] Board Policy 6.03 defers to the Curriculum Committee on curriculum development. Administrative Procedures 6.03 provides details regarding implementation.[20] The Curriculum Committee has its own set of policies on how courses should be developed. These policies are consistent with state and federal regulations regarding the relationship between units and hours, and the definitions of and consistent use of hours.

---

[16] CCSF Academic Year Calendar 2016-2017

[17] CCSF 2016-2017 Catalog , p. 21, Student Classification (12 units per semester)

[18] CCSF 2016-2017 Catalog, p. 446, Academic Policies and Procedures

[19] Curriculum Committee Website - Policies page

[20] Draft AP 6.03 (recommended by Academic Senate in May 2016 along with revised BP 6.03; moving through formal adoption process)

Analysis and Evaluation of the College's Compliance with the Commission Policy on Institutional Degrees and Credits

CCSF meets this policy with written policies regarding unit:hour ratios, definitions of all hour types (lecture, lab, and work experience), and consistent application of these unit:hour ratios across all courses and programs. Such policies and procedures, including those pertaining to credit by examination can be found in online handbooks and the College Catalog.

Response to Findings from the Restoration Evaluation Team/January 2015 Action Letter. The Restoration Evaluation Report included the following comments related to this Standard:

> *CCSF does not have written policies and procedures for determining a credit hour. In an interview with college staff, it was stated that some courses require a greater number of contact hours for the amount of units granted than generally accepted norms in higher education. This was confirmed by reviewing course outlines. For example, the course outline of record for Accounting 1 lists 5 lecture hours as the weekly contact time, but the course has a unit value of 4. An example was also found of awarding too many units for the contact time listed on the course outline of record in Physical Education 200C. Justification for these variances in contact time to unit value is not present on the course outlines of record and college staff provided no justification in interviews. The college self-reports that while its curriculum review process now includes review of hours and units of credit, addressed in the Curriculum Committee Handbook, it lacks Board Policy on the award of credit and consistency of credit awarded. It has established timelines for the development and approval of such policies.*

As noted above, the College has addressed these issues.

Commission Policy on Transfer of Credit

Accredited institutions have a responsibility to provide for effective transfer of credit that minimizes student difficulties in moving between institutions while assuring the high quality of their education. Each institution is responsible for determining its own policies and practices with regard to the transfer and award of credit including transfer of credits from non-accredited institutions. Institutions shall establish policies on the transfer of credit that are clearly stated and that function in a manner that is fair and equitable to students. At the same time, institutions shall be responsible for careful evaluation of credits that students wish to transfer. Institutions must balance responsiveness to students' preferences about transfer of credit and institutional commitment to the value and quality of degrees, certificates, or other credentials that the receiving institution awards.

Evidence that CCSF Complies with the Commission Policy on Transfer of Credit

The Academic Policies section of the Catalog describes the policies and procedures for consideration of transfer of credit, as does the Transfer Center website, the Office of Admissions and Records/Registration website, and the Course Equivalency Form.[21] [22] [23] [24]

The College makes decisions about whether to accept transfer of credit from other institutions to CCSF in two ways:

- **General units applied toward graduation**. Students submit official transcripts and a completed Request for Transcript Evaluation Form to the Office of Admissions and Records/Registration.[25] Admissions and Records personnel review and verify that transcripts come from regionally accredited colleges or universities and researches and vets out-of-state, private, or foreign colleges (no outside verification services are used). Prior to sign-off, Admissions and Records staff ensure that the level of credit(s) earned at the sending institution are comparable to those of the credit(s) offered at CCSF. If the student is planning to earn one of the Associate Degrees for Transfer (ADT), the Office of Admissions and Records/Registration relies on the expertise of counselors to determine if the student has met the requirements to earn the ADT.

- **Course equivalency units that are used to either satisfy prerequisites or general education required courses**. Students submit official transcripts and a completed Request for Transcript Evaluation Form to the Office of Admissions and Records/Registration. Admissions and Records personnel review and verify that transcripts come from regionally accredited colleges or universities and researches and vets out-of-state, private, or foreign colleges (no outside verification services are used). Where course matching is clear based on course descriptions, Assist.org, or previous departmental approvals, Admissions and Records staff accept the transfer credit. Where course matching is unclear, Admissions and Records staff direct students to submit a Course Equivalency Form and copy of their transcript to the chairs of the departments that offer the equivalent courses. Prior to sign-off, chairs ensure that the nature, content, associated student learning outcomes, and level of credit(s) earned at the sending institution are comparable to those of the credit(s) offered at CCSF. After completion of the form, the department chairs forward it to Admissions and Records, where personnel use official transcripts on record for final verification.

---

[21] CCSF 2016-2017 Catalog Page 452 of Academic Policies, p. 56 Transfer Information, and p.16 Admissions Information (PDF) [22] CCSF Transfer Center (website)

[23] CCSF Admissions and Records Incoming Transcript Evaluation Procedures (web page)

[24] Course Equivalency Form

[25] Request for Transcript Evaluation

The Office of Instruction maintains the Course Equivalency Form, and it is available in paper form through counseling offices. The Office of Admissions and Records/Registration maintains and makes available the Request for Transcript Evaluation Form.

The Educational Policies Committee (a subcommittee of the Academic Senate) periodically reviews the CCSF Transfer Credit policy and procedures and updates them when needed. The College makes minor updates/clarification to policy language (with no real change to the policy) in conjunction with the Catalog update each year.[26] The Course Equivalency Form itself goes through minor updates regularly as a result of Office of Instruction review.

Analysis and Evaluation of the College's Compliance with the Commission Policy on Transfer of Credit

CCSF adheres to this policy by publicly disclosing its transfer credit policies in the College Catalog and online. In the 2016-17 College Catalog, the policy information clearly outlines procedures, deadlines, and documents needed from sending institutions when attempting transfer of credit as well as essential academic factors that are involved in transfer of credit decisions (such as existing course equivalencies, content and/or student learning outcomes, grades, course level and applicability toward a degree, certificate, or program prerequisite).[27] The current language reflects improvements that the College chose to make during review of this Commission Policy. The changes resulted in a more complete description, including how students can access the form and deadlines. The Educational Policies Committee periodically reviews policies and updates them accordingly.

Commission Policy on Distance Education and on Correspondence Education

Commission policy specifies that all learning opportunities provided by accredited institutions must have equivalent quality, accountability, and focus on student outcomes, regardless of mode of delivery. This policy provides a framework that allows institutions the flexibility to adapt their delivery modes to the emerging needs of students and society while maintaining quality. Any institution offering courses and programs through distance education or correspondence education is expected to meet the requirements of accreditation in each of its courses and programs and at each of its sites.

Evidence that CCSF Complies with the Commission Policy on Distance Education and on Correspondence Education

Compliance with Policy Statement and Elements 1 and 2. CCSF delivers distance instruction to students via the Internet where the instructor and the student are separated. The College no longer offers distance education via DVDs/CD-Roms. CCSF does not offer correspondence education. The Curriculum Committee-approved document, "Definitions and Terminology for

---

[26] Academic Senate - Educational Policies Committee
[27] 2016-2017 Catalog, p 56 - Transfer Credit Policy

Distance Learning Courses," articulates the policies and procedures for defining distance education.[28] The Curriculum Committee must approve any revisions to this document. The College's Distance Learning Coordinator helped establish a Regular and Effective Contact Policy to support regular and substantive interaction in the distance education environment.

CCSF provides equivalent quality in distance learning. The development and implementation of distance learning supports CCSF's total educational mission. Before a class is offered online, the faculty member interested in developing the class for distance learning must complete an application.[29] The Distance Learning Advisory Committee reviews applications and selects those for development with one of the criteria being how offering the course via distance learning meets the College's mission.[30] Applicants also complete Exhibit O from the AFT 2121 Contract.[31] After a course is selected, the Educational Technology Department works closely with the faculty member in the development of the course. The faculty member is required to complete the hybrid online course, Introduction to Online Teaching and Learning (IOTL) with the Distance Learning and Teaching Specialist (also a faculty member).[32] [33]

After completing the IOTL course, the faculty member spends at least one and sometimes two semesters building the online class. The Educational Technology Department and the Alternative Media Specialist review the class multiple times for quality by using the Online Education Initiative Course Rubric.[34] The Collective Bargaining Agreement and professional development maintain the quality of distance learning. Regular professional development and support are provided throughout the semester (web resources, drop-in help labs, one-to-one appointments, and workshops).

After the course is offered online, it becomes part of the evaluation cycle for the faculty member assigned to teach that course. The "Procedure for Evaluation of Academic Employees" provides a section specific to distance learning.[35] Additionally, students in an online class complete the Student Evaluation, the same form used for face-to-face classes, in the learning management system.[36] All faculty who teach a distance learning course at CCSF are members of the Educational Technology Department. As such, faculty can participate in monthly meetings, schedule one-on-one sessions with the Distance Learning and Teaching Specialist, and access the Resource Center for Distance Learning Faculty. [37]

---

[28] Definitions and Terminology for Distance Learning Courses
[29] Application to Develop a Distance Learning Class
[30] Distance Learning Advisory Committee
[31] Exhibit O from AFT 2121 Contract, p. 254
[32] Process for Teaching an Online Class
[33] Process for Teaching a New Online Class
[34] Online Education Initiative Course Rubric
[35] Procedure for the Evaluation of Academic Employees
[36] Student Evaluation Form of Faculty
[37] For Online Faculty

CCSF controls the development and implementation of distance learning via the "Application to Develop a Distance Learning Class."[38] Academic Affairs funds the development of 24 credit units of distance learning per academic year. Perkins funds the development of 15 units of distance learning per academic year.

CCSF provides equivalent accountability in distance learning. The "Procedure for Evaluation of Academic Employees" provides a framework for equivalent accountability in distance learning including assessment of regular and effective contact.

The College-wide Curriculum Committee has established "Regular and Effective Contact Standards."[39] Before a course is offered online, a "Distance Education Addenda (DEA) Trace Checklist" addresses necessary elements for Regular and Effective Contact.[40] Regular and Effective Contact is also a separate topic block in the Resource Center for Distance Learning Faculty and it is part of the "Introduction to Online Teaching and Learning" course that faculty complete prior to teaching online. Additionally, the Distance Learning and Teaching Specialist and the Distance Learning Coordinator conduct random Regular and Effective Contact Checks using a checklist.[41] The College does not partner with other organizations to offering distance education and thus controls all aspects of its development, implementation, and evaluation.

Compliance with Elements 3 and 4. CCSF has clearly defined and appropriate student learning outcomes for all courses and programs, including those delivered via distance learning.[42] CCSF provides equivalent focus on student outcomes in distance learning. Faculty include student learning outcomes (SLOs) in their syllabi regardless of mode.[43] Course Outlines of Record contain SLOs and faculty update them within a six-year cycle.[44] Faculty regularly assess SLOs via an established and compliant process.[45] All faculty contribute to the SLO process and as such, contributions are part of the AFT 2121 Contract and the Evaluation for Academic Employees.[46] [47] A Curriculum Committee-approved Distance Education Addendum is required before a distance learning class is scheduled for online delivery.[48] The Distance Education Addenda Subcommittee reviews all DEAs before final approval by the Curriculum Committee.[49] The DEA Subcommittee works within the Curriculum Committee Guidelines.[50] Information specific to an addendum is found in the Distance Education Chapter of the CurricUNET

---

[38] Application to Develop a Distance Learning Class

[39] Regular and Effective Contact Standards

[40] DEA Trace Checklist

[41] Regular and Effective Contact Checklist

[42] SLO Assessment Reports

[43] Requirement that SLO's are in Syllabi (Source: Faculty Handbook, section 4.7), SLOs in faculty syllabi

[44] Course Outline showing SLOs, Course Outlines of Record with SLOs, Examples: English AA Major ; Chinese (Mandarin) AA Major

[45] SLO Assessment Process

[46] AFT 2121 Contract

[47] Evaluation for Academic Employees

[48] Distance Education Chapter of the Curriculum Committee Handbook

[49] DEA Subcommittee Description

[50] College-wide Curriculum Committee Guidelines

Curriculum User Manual.[51] Additionally, the Educational Technology Department Chair/Distance Learning Coordinator regularly reminds faculty via email and at department meetings to make certain that student learning outcomes are clearly visible in their online classes.

Compliance with Elements 5 and 6. The Office of Instruction regularly calculates and updates a summary and detailed report of the list of programs, degree or certificate, in which 50 percent or more of the courses are available via distance learning.[52] [53] Based on this summary, the College submits Substantive Change Proposals when warranted.

CCSF submitted a Substantive Change Proposal for Change in the Mode of Delivery in February 2014.[54] However, since the College had received a "Show Cause" sanction by the Commission in July 2012, the Commission did not accept this Substantive Change Proposal given Commission policy that restricts institutions on sanction from submitting a Substantive Change Proposal. Thus, the College has not been eligible to submit substantive change proposals since 2012. In January 2015, the Commission approved the College's application for "Restoration Status." ACCJC has communicated to CCSF's ALO that the College is still ineligible to submit a Substantive Change Proposal while in Restoration Status.

Compliance with Element 7. CCSF has processes in place to insure that the student who registers for an online class is the student who participates and completes the class. Board Policy and Administrative Procedure 6.28 (Student Authentication) both identify CCSF's compliance with the Commission Policy on student authentication.[55] Additionally, a link to the Student Code of Conduct is in the log-in block of the learning management system.[56] The Distance Education Addendum requires the completion of a section on Distance Integrity before a course is approved by the Curriculum Committee for online delivery.[57] Best practices are shared with faculty teaching distance learning.[58] The Resource Center for Distance Learning Faculty contains information about student authentication.[59] CCSF annually publishes policies notifying students about privacy.

Analysis and Evaluation of the College's Compliance with the Commission Policy on Distance Education and on Correspondence Education

The College complies with all elements of this Commission Policy:

---

[51] Distance Education Chapter of the CurricUNET User Manual
[52] Detailed Report of Programs Available via Distance Learning
[53] Summary Report of Programs Available via Distance Learning
[54] Substantive Change Proposal - Change in Mode of Delivery
[55] BP 6.28 Student Authentication; AP 6.28 Student Authentication
[56] Login page for Insight
[57] Distance Learning Chapter in Curriculum Committee Handbook
[58] Best Practices by WCET
[59] Information about Resource Center for Distance Learning Faculty

- It ensures that faculty who teach online receive the appropriate preparation to do so and faculty have access to ongoing professional development. The College maintains all control over distance education offerings as it does not partner with an external provider of distance education. The Distance Education Learning Coordinator reviews regularly the materials and regular effective contact for courses that are in progress to confirm they continue to meet requirements (non-punitive, but to help identify and fix any issues in order to meet compliance requirements). *(Elements 1 and 2)*

- Distance learning courses must meet the same requirements as all CCSF courses. Each distance learning course has an approved addenda that sits atop the Curriculum Committee approved Course Outline of Record and explains how the requirements of the base course will be achieved in the online environment. Since the base Course Outline of Record applies to all versions of a course regardless of mode, the same Student Learning Outcomes are assessed and all expectations on students (to achieve) and instructors (to assess and report) are identical. Student Learning Outcomes must be on all syllabi, and chairs and deans check these. *(Elements 3 and 4)*

- To demonstrate due diligence, CCSF submitted a Substantive Change Proposal for Change in Mode of Delivery in February 2014, which, given the Show Cause sanction the College had received, the Commission did not accept. In January 2015, the Commission approved the College's application for Restoration Status, but the College remains ineligible to submit a Substantive Change Proposal per communications with ACCJC. *(Elements 5 and 6)*

- The College addresses student authentication in multiple ways, including a new Board Policy and Administrative Procedures on Student Authentication. *(Element 7)*

Commission Policy on Representation of Accredited Status

... institutions on probation, show cause, or termination status must disclose that information to students and prospective students and in any publication where the institution makes reference to its accredited status.

An institution must post information for the public concerning its accredited status online, no more than one page (one click) from the institution's homepage. That information will include the representation of accredited status noted below, reports and documents concerning accreditation activities and related data required to be available to the public, and information concerning programmatic accreditation.

Evidence that CCSF Complies with the Commission Policy on Representation of Accredited Status

CCSF posts information for the public concerning its accredited status online, and that information is one click from the institution's homepage.[60] The information on that page includes a description of CCSF's accredited status, links to reports and documents concerning accreditation activities, and information concerning programmatic accreditation.[61] CCSF's accreditation web pages also provide detailed information about each programmatic accreditor.[62] CCSF discloses its status as an institution currently on "Restoration Status" to students and prospective students on the website, in the College Catalog, and in the Class Schedule.[63] [64] [65] Statements about the College's current restoration status also refer individuals to ACCJC's *Accreditation Reference Handbook* (July 2015) for a specific description of what constitutes "Restoration Status." The College accreditation website states that a visiting team will return to CCSF to re-evaluate the college's progress in the Fall of 2016.[66] In all formats (web and print), CCSF consistently refers to its status as an accredited institution using the language provided in the ACCJC Policy on the Representation of Accredited Status.[67]

Analysis of the College's Compliance with the Commission Policy on Representation of Accredited Status

The College complies with this policy by maintaining dedicated web pages and updated print catalogs and time schedules that name its accreditors, accurately and appropriately describe its accredited status, including disclosing its level of sanction.

Commission Policy on Student and Public Complaints against Institutions

The Commission requires that each accredited institution have in place student grievance and public complaint policies and procedures that are reasonable, fairly administered, and well publicized. A complainant filing a complaint with the Commission should demonstrate that a serious effort has been made to pursue all review procedures provided by the institution.

---

[60] Screenshot of CCSF's Homepage Showing Link to Accreditation Page

[61] Screenshot of CCSF's Main Accreditation Page

[62] Screenshot of CCSF's Programmatic Accreditation Page

[63] Screenshot of CCSF's Main Accreditation Page

[64] Screenshot of College Accreditation in CCSF College Catalog 2016-17, p. 2 (Source: College Catalog - Overview of the College, p. 2)

[65] Screenshot of College Accreditation in Fall 2016 Class Schedule, p. 27 (Source: Fall 2016 Class Schedule - Front Matter, p. 27)

[66] Screenshot of CCSF's Main Accreditation Page

[67] Screenshot of CCSF's Main Accreditation Page

Evidence that CCSF Complies with the Commission Policy on Student and Public Complaints against Institutions

CCSF has clear policies and procedures for handling student complaints, and the current policies and procedures are accessible to students in the College Catalog and online.

CCSF's Student Development Division maintains a website that contains active links to the various types of grievances that students and community members are able to file.[68] This ensures that students can quickly access current policy information and complaint procedures and identify the resources they need to resolve their complaints. This site also contains cross links for those wanting to file complaints with CCSF's accreditor, or with the California Community College Chancellor's Office.

Students can also find information in the College Catalog on how to file complaints against other students, against classified staff members, against faculty members and against administrators.[69] Students are encouraged to mediate situations by requesting advocacy prior to filing a formal grievance, and the student services website provides guidelines to students on how to request advocacy.[70] Faculty, administrators, and students also serve on a Student Grade and File Review Board that reviews individual student grievances over course grades and file contents. Information on how to appeal a grade is available in the College Catalog and on the website.[71] [72] CCSF provides matriculation services for incoming students to determine placement in Math and/or English. Information is available in the College Catalog and online for students who feel they have experienced discrimination in the matriculation process and wish to file a grievance.[73] Students and community members can also access information about how to file grievances for sexual harassment and discrimination via the Student Services website.[74] Additional information on the Unlawful Discrimination and Harassment Policy can be found in the College Catalog and online.[75] [76] The Board Policy on Sexual Harassment also provides information to students on how to file a grievance.[77]

CCSF provides information to the public on how to file a complaint with ACCJC or any of its programmatic accreditors or licensors. Information on CCSF's accredited status, as well as how to file a complaint against the College with the ACCJC is available on the main Accreditation

---

[68] Screenshot of CCSF Grievance Procedures Webpage

[69] College Rules and Regulations, p. 438 (source: 2016-2017 City College of San Francisco Catalog, p. 438)

[70] CCSF Advocacy and Grievance System

[71] College Rules and Regulations, p. 439-440 (source: 2016-2017 City College of San Francisco Catalog, p. 439-440)

[72] Screenshot of CCSF Grievance Procedures Webpage

[73] Screenshot Matriculation Grievance Process, p. 19-20 (source: 2016-2017 City College of San Francisco Catalog, p. 19-20)

[74] Screenshot of CCSF Grievance Procedures Webpage

[75] College Rules and Regulations, p. 428 (source: 2016-2017 City College of San Francisco Catalog, p. 428)

[76] Screenshot of CCSF Grievance Procedures Webpage

[77] Sexual Harassment BP 1.36

webpage.[78] Detailed information on programmatic accreditors including their contact information is available on a separate (but linked) web page.[79]

The student complaint files for the previous six years (since the last comprehensive evaluation) are available; the files demonstrate accurate implementation of the complaint policies and procedures. These files are maintained by Student Services and can be accessed if requested by speaking with the Vice Chancellor of Student Development.

Analysis of the College's Compliance with the Commission Policy on Student and Public Complaints against Institutions

CCSF complies with this policy by listing complaint policies and information in its Catalog and maintaining websites within both the Accreditation webpages and Student Services webpages that provide detailed information for students and community members on filing grievances.

CCSF provides a listing and contact information for all of its programmatic accreditors, one link from the main Accreditation page, to allow students and community members to easily contact any of CCSF's programmatic accreditors.

CCSF maintains student complaint files for a minimum of six years as required. These files are housed in the office of the Vice Chancellor of Student Development.

Commission Policy on Institutional Advertising, Student Recruitment, and Representation of Accredited Status

All accredited institutions, or individuals acting on their behalf, must exhibit integrity and responsibility in advertising, student recruitment, and representation of accredited status. Responsible self-regulation requires rigorous attention to principles of good practice.

Evidence that CCSF Complies with the Commission Policy on Institutional Advertising, Student Recruitment, and Representation of Accredited Status

Advertising, Publications, Promotional Literature. Educational programs and services are the focus of advertisements, publications, and promotional literature that the College puts forth. The primary source of information about educational programs and services is the CCSF College Catalog.[80] The annual, academic year Catalog is clear, concise, and well organized. The College updates the Catalog annually to maintain information currency.[81] CCSF publishes information required by this Commission Policy in its Catalog:

---

[78] Screenshot of Main CCSF Accreditation Webpage (source: College Website)
[79] Screenshot of Programmatic Accreditation Webpage (source: College Website)
[80] CCSF College Catalog
[81] Screenshot showing that the Catalog is updated annually

Front Matter[82]
- official name, addresses, telephone numbers, and website address of the institution
- institutional mission statement
- members of the governing board
- statements of non-discrimination in six languages

Overview of the College[83]
- the accredited status of the institution, including any specialized or program accreditation that may be required for licensure or employment in the field, or the lack thereof

Admission to the College[84]
- entrance requirements and procedures
- tuition, fees, and other program costs
- policies and procedures for refunding fees and charges to students who withdraw from enrollment

Student Financial Resources[85]
- opportunities and requirements for financial aid

Learning Resources and Student Services[86]
- institutional facilities readily available for educational use

Programs and Courses[87]
- basic information on programs and courses with required sequences and frequency of course offerings explicitly stated[88]
- degree, certificate, and program completion requirements, including length of time required to obtain a degree or certificate[89]

College Rules and Regulations[90]
- rules and regulations for conduct
- statements of nondiscrimination

Academic Policies and Procedures[91]
- the institution's academic freedom statement
- policies related to the transfer of credits from other institutions
- location of publications where other institutional policies may be found

---

[82] CCSF College Catalog, p. III, Front Matter
[83] CCSF College Catalog, p.2 Overview of the College
[84] CCSF College Catalog, p. 16, Admission to the College
[85] CCSF College Catalog, p. 30, Student Financial Resources
[86] CCSF College Catalog, p. 34, Learning Resources and Student Services
[87] CCSF College Catalog, p. 67, Programs and Courses
[88] CCSF College Catalog, p.24, Front General Information on Courses + under course description; Curriculum Committee Resolution [89] CCSF College Catalog, p. 329, Program Descriptions; Curriculum Committee Resolution
[90] CCSF College Catalog, p. 427, College Rules and Regulations
[91] CCSF College Catalog, p.446, Academic Policies and Procedures

Faculty and Administration of City College[92]
- names of faculty and administrators with degrees held and the conferring institution

Students may purchase hard copies of the Catalog at the CCSF Bookstore, may view copies in College libraries and all departmental offices, or may view an electronic copy online. The College provides hard copies of the Catalog to certain College personnel, including counselors.

The other major College publication from the Office of Instruction is the Class Schedule. In addition to detailed information about course offerings, the Class Schedule contains important information about admissions, registration, course fees, and materials fees. It also includes telephone numbers, web addresses, and maps to guide students to additional sources of policies and other information. The Office of Instruction produces Class Schedules in both print and online versions.

The online Class Schedule has sidebar links for further information.[93] All residents of San Francisco receive the Class Schedule by mail. Additionally, the College sends postcards to San Francisco residents as a reminder that the Catalog and Class Schedule are available online and that free printed schedules are available at all Campus and Center locations.

Student Recruitment. Student recruitment is guided by the College's Student Development Division, in collaboration with the College's External Affairs Director who oversees marketing and advertising with the purpose of student recruitment. The College does not use independent agents for recruiting purposes. Student Outreach is coordinated by the Office of Outreach Services.[94] CCSF does not promise job placement or employment to prospective students. The College charges program costs on a per-unit basis as specified by the Community College System.

Outreach and Recruitment (Local). Through College-wide consultation and collaboration, the Office of Outreach Services at CCSF conducts outreach initiatives in order to expand, improve, and promote greater access for prospective students. The Office of Outreach Services provides high-quality comprehensive college-readiness services to prospective students, high school and middle school students, K-12 faculty, staff, administrators from both public and private sectors, and community-based organizations. The Office provides early-outreach services to ensure prospective students are knowledgeable and prepared for the college experience.[95]

Outreach and Recruitment (International). The Office of International Education conducts international recruitment in a variety of ways. First, its website contains key application and enrollment dates. Prospective students call or email the office for information. In addition, the office maintains a Twitter and Facebook account.[96]

---

[92] CCSF College Catalog, p.460, Faculty & Administration of City College
[93] CCSF Online Class Schedule
[94] Screenshot - Outreach and Recruitment Services: (Source: Outreach Services Website)
[95] Office of Outreach Services Website
[96] Office of International Education Website

A second form of recruitment is done through advertising in international education publications that reach Asian, African, European, and Latin American countries. One publication is *Study in the United States,* which contains CCSF school information in Mandarin, Vietnamese, Portuguese, Spanish, and English. CCSF also maintains a listing in the *International Student Guide to the United States of America.*[97] Both publications contain a half-page advertisement about CCSF, which includes information about the College's academic programs.

Lastly, the Office of International Education performs outreach at recruitment fairs abroad. In Fall 2015, for example, CCSF participated in the EducationUSA Recruitment Fair in South America. EducationUSA is a U.S. Department of State network of over 400 international student advising centers in more than 170 countries.

Representation of Accredited Status. CCSF complies with the Commission Policy on the Representation of Accredited Status as noted earlier and thus complies with the portion of this Commission Policy related to representation of accredited status. The term "accreditation" is only used to describe the official accredited status conferred by the Commission. CCSF maintains web pages dedicated to accreditation, as well as a list of programmatic accreditors complete with contact information.[98] [99] CCSF also clearly articulates its accredited status in the College Catalog and Class Schedule.

Analysis and Evaluation of the College's Compliance with the Commission Policy on Institutional Advertising, Student Recruitment, and Representation of Accredited Status

The College is in compliance with the Policy on Institutional Advertising, Student Recruitment, and Representation of Accredited Status. The College includes information as required by the Commission in its Catalog and exhibits integrity and responsibility in advertising, student recruitment, and representation of accredited status.

Commission Policy on Contractual Relationships with Non-Regionally Accredited Organizations

When an institution contracts certain functions to a related entity, the institution is responsible to the Commission for presenting, explaining, and evaluating all significant matters and relationships involving related entities that may affect accreditation requirements and decisions at the time of eligibility review, candidacy review, initial accreditation, comprehensive review, follow-up and special reports, and all other times deemed relevant by the Commission. Although a related entity may affect an institution's ongoing compliance with the Accreditation Standards, the Commission will review and hold responsible only the applicant, candidate, or accredited institution for compliance with the Accreditation Standards. The Commission will protect the confidential nature of all information submitted

---

[97] CCSF page in International Student Guide to the United States of America
[98] CCSF Accreditation Website
[99] CCSF Programmatic Accreditors

by the institutions or by related entities except as otherwise required by law or other Commission policies.

If an institution is part of a district/system with shared facilities or processes (e.g., library) or centralized information (e.g., strategic plan), the institution may use documents prepared by the district/system in its report to the Commission.

The accredited institution's obligation to report any changes in control, legal status or ownership through its substantive change process also applies to related entities.

Evidence that CCSF Complies with the Commission Policy on Contractual Relationships with Non-Regionally Accredited Organizations

The College does not contract responsibilities for programs and services, such as recruitment, admission, student support, online support, instructional curriculum materials, and student authenticated processes to non-regionally accredited organizations.

In general, in instances where the College does contract with other organizations, it maintains policies, procedures, and processes that ensure all contractual agreements are consistent with the mission, vision, and values of the institution. The response to Standard III.D.16. describes these policies, procedures, and processes.

Analysis and Evaluation of the College's Compliance with the Commission Policy on Contractual Relationships with Non-Regionally Accredited Organizations

The institution is in compliance with the Policy on Contractual Relationships with Non-Regionally Accredited Institutions.

Commission Policy on Institutional Compliance with Title IV

Institutions participating in the Title IV programs under the HEA and designating the Commission as their gate-keeping agency must be able to demonstrate diligence in keeping loan default rates at an acceptably low level and must also comply with program responsibilities defined by the U.S. Department of Education. Institutions that have a default rate requiring a default reduction plan should provide a copy of their plan to the Commission. Commission staff shall review the plan to determine its appropriateness, and to determine if any follow-up action is needed. Excessive default rates in the student loan program may be cause for a special report or evaluation.

Evidence that CCSF Complies with the Commission Policy on Institutional Compliance with Title IV

The annual fiscal year cohort default rate published by the U.S. Department of Education serves as a gauge to manage and monitor City College of San Francisco's compliance with federal requirements. City College of San Francisco's default rates are at acceptable levels, although the College regularly strives for improvement through student loan counseling and

follow up by contacting students.[100] For example, the Financial Aid Office contacts borrowers whose payments are 30 days past due via email in addition to issuing past due letters. In addition, the Financial Aid Office educates borrowers regarding viable repayment options, as well as educating them about forbearance versus deferment.

The Financial Aid Office undergoes an annual external audit for compliance with Title IV regulations. Any findings or recommendations are reported to the Chancellor and then Board of Trustees, and the College implements corrective actions immediately to assure compliance with federal and state regulations. City College of San Francisco is not under any sanction nor is it required at this time to have a formal default reduction plan on file with the Commission or the U.S. Department of Education. City College of San Francisco is not under any warning or notification that it is engaged in fraud or abuse or that it is unable to meet its responsibilities in the proper administration of Title IV funds and programs.

The response to Standard III.D.15. provides additional information about the College's compliance with Title IV and its student loan default rates.

Analysis and Evaluation of the College's Compliance with the Commission Policy on Institutional Compliance with Title IV

CCSF has maintained its default rates below the maximum permitted by the U.S. Department of Education. The College has a practice in place to monitor and manage student loan default rates and the overall student loan program to ensure compliance with all applicable requirements. The College is in compliance with the Policy on Title IV. The Perkins Loan program is operating in full compliance in all loan phases of billing, collection and default, and mandated federal regulations.

---

[100] Restoration Evaluation Report, page 186 (source: CCSF Accreditation Website - Restoration Evaluation Report)

Changes and Plans Arising out of the Self Evaluation Process Related to Compliance with Commission Policies

Changes Arising Out of the Self Evaluation Process Related to Compliance with Commission Policies				
Goal	**Associated Action(s)**	**Person Responsible**	**Completion Date**	**Outcome**
Ensure consistent methods to convert course hours to units of credit and that the College Catalog contains accurate information regarding the award of credit per the Academic Senate Curriculum Committee standard of 52.5 hours of lecture, study, or laboratory work per unit of credit, as documented in the CCSF's Curriculum Handbook (Commission Policy on Institutional Degrees and Credits; Standard II.A.4; Standard II.A.9.)	Review all courses and make adjustments to course hours and/or course units where these were inconsistent with the standard established by the Curriculum Committee. Update the 2016-17 Catalog to contain this new information.	Office of Instruction Curriculum Committee	May 2016	2016-17 Catalog indicates that each unit of credit is based on 52.5 hours of lecture, study, or laboratory work only includes courses for which consistent method of converting hours to units of credit was used.
Clear presentation of procedures, deadlines, and documents regarding transfer of credit in 2016-17 College Catalog (Commission Policy on Transfer of Credit)	Update 2016-17 Catalog to contain clear procedures, deadlines, and documents regarding transfer of credit	Office of Instruction Articulation Officer	May 2016	Catalog contains clear procedures, deadlines, and documents regarding transfer of credit
Adopt a Student Authentication Policy to ensure verification of students' identities in distance learning classes (Commission Policy on Distance Education and Standard III.C.5.)	Draft a Student Authentication policy and procedures Obtain approval of Student Authentication policy and procedures Implement Student Authentication policy and procedures	Chief Technology Officer General Counsel	1st read of BP 6.28 (Student Authentication) took place on June 23, 2016; Board adopted this policy on July 28, 2016; posting on website expected in early August 2016 with immediate implementation	Adopted Board policy and implementation to ensure confirmation of distance learning students' identity

Plans Arising Out of the Self Evaluation Process Related to Compliance with Commission Policies				
Goal	**Associated Action(s)**	**Person Responsible/ accountable to complete action**	**Expected Completion**	**Expected Outcome**
Adopt a Board Policy and Administrative Procedures on the award of credit (Commission Policy on Institutional Degrees and Credits; Standard II.A.4.; Standard II.A.9.)	Work through established Board approval process	VC Academic Affairs AVC Instruction Curriculum Committee	BP 6.03 and AP 6.03 were recommended by the Academic Senate on May 25, 2016 but need to be reviewed by PGC as information only in Fall 2016 and then adopted by the Board (BP 6.03) and Chancellor (AP 6.03)	Clear policy and practice related to the award of credit. Adopted BP and AP 6.03 on the award of credit